

Wide-Field Infrared Survey Explorer data set review

Beatrice Mueller

Summary

This data set is well worth archiving into the PDS.
I had no problems opening the tables in the PDS4Viewer.
I consider the collection certified.
Some things can be improved and some need correction.

Documentation

Overview.txt: Needs to be expanded. Instead of just 'for more information, expand to e.g. Definitions of the terms in the tables and methodologies how the obtained values were derived are given in Bauer et. al 2017.
Table 1 lists several references for the model number. These should be either in the overview.txt under References following the overview text (unless the collection itself has a reference file) or it should mention in the table description, that these references are found in Bauer et al., 2017. The .pdf paper is open access, but is explicit permission still needed for reproduction in the PDS?
collection.xml: it would be nice to have the ORCiDs (if available) in the List_Authors.
I presume, this will get a doi.

Data

The provided values I am knowledgeable about are reasonable.
both tables: Explicitly state in the Product Description, that the terms and methodologies are described in Bauer et al. 2017
comet type heading is incorrect: should be SPC and LPC
table 1:
Suggestions: use comet designation rather than comet name;
either use 'flux ... is from a' or 'fluxes... are from a';
...indicated in the eighth column (---> indicated as;
remove (Nf)